

# **AGENDA**

# **Cabinet**

Date: Monday 12 July 2010

Time: **2.00 pm** 

Place: The Council Chamber, Brockington, 35 Hafod Road,

Hereford

Notes: Please note the time, date and venue of the meeting.

For any further information please contact:

Sally Cole, Committee Manager Executive

Tel: (01432) 260249

Email: scole@herefordshire.gov.uk

If you would like help to understand this document, or would like it in another format or language, please call Sally Cole, Committee Manager Executive on (01432) 260249 or e-mail scole@herefordshire.gov.uk in advance of the meeting.

# Agenda for the Meeting of the Cabinet

Membership

Chairman Vice-Chairman

**Councillor RJ Phillips** 

Councillor LO Barnett
Councillor AJM Blackshaw
Councillor H Bramer
Councillor JP French
Councillor JA Hyde
Councillor JG Jarvis
Councillor PD Price
Councillor DB Wilcox

**Non Voting** 

#### **GUIDANCE ON DECLARING PERSONAL AND PREJUDICIAL INTERESTS AT MEETINGS**

The Council's Members' Code of Conduct requires Councillors to declare against an Agenda item(s) the nature of an interest and whether the interest is personal or prejudicial. Councillors have to decide first whether or not they have a personal interest in the matter under discussion. They will then have to decide whether that personal interest is also prejudicial.

A personal interest is an interest that affects the Councillor more than most other people in the area. People in the area include those who live, work or have property in the area of the Council. Councillors will also have a personal interest if their partner, relative or a close friend, or an organisation that they or the member works for, is affected more than other people in the area. If they do have a personal interest, they must declare it but can stay and take part and vote in the meeting.

Whether an interest is prejudicial is a matter of judgement for each Councillor. What Councillors have to do is ask themselves whether a member of the public – if he or she knew all the facts – would think that the Councillor's interest was so important that their decision would be affected by it. If a Councillor has a prejudicial interest then they must declare what that interest is. A Councillor who has declared a prejudicial interest at a meeting may nevertheless be able to address that meeting, but only in circumstances where an ordinary member of the public would be also allowed to speak. In such circumstances, the Councillor concerned will have the same opportunity to address the meeting and on the same terms. However, a Councillor exercising their ability to speak in these circumstances must leave the meeting immediately after they have spoken.

#### **AGENDA**

# APOLOGIES FOR ABSENCE To receive any apologies for absence. DECLARATIONS OF INTEREST To receive any declarations of interest by Members in respect of items on the Agenda. THE FUTURE OF DILWYN CHURCH OF ENGLAND (C OF E) PRIMARY SCHOOL To consider options for the future of Dilwyn Church of England Primary School (Dilwyn School) and the key reasons for the recommendations.

# The Public's Rights to Information and Attendance at Meetings

#### YOU HAVE A RIGHT TO: -

- Attend all Council, Cabinet, Committee and Sub-Committee meetings unless the business to be transacted would disclose 'confidential' or 'exempt' information.
- Inspect agenda and public reports at least five clear days before the date of the meeting.
- Inspect minutes of the Council and all Committees and Sub-Committees and written statements of decisions taken by the Cabinet or individual Cabinet Members for up to six years following a meeting.
- Inspect background papers used in the preparation of public reports for a period of up to four years from the date of the meeting. (A list of the background papers to a report is given at the end of each report). A background paper is a document on which the officer has relied in writing the report and which otherwise is not available to the public.
- Access to a public Register stating the names, addresses and wards of all Councillors with details of the membership of Cabinet and of all Committees and Sub-Committees.
- Have a reasonable number of copies of agenda and reports (relating to items to be considered in public) made available to the public attending meetings of the Council, Cabinet, Committees and Sub-Committees.
- Have access to a list specifying those powers on which the Council have delegated decision making to their officers identifying the officers concerned by title.
- Copy any of the documents mentioned above to which you have a right of access, subject to a reasonable charge (20p per sheet subject to a maximum of £5.00 per agenda plus a nominal fee of £1.50 for postage).
- Access to this summary of your rights as members of the public to attend meetings of the Council, Cabinet, Committees and Sub-Committees and to inspect and copy documents.

# **Public Transport Links**

- Public transport access can be gained to Brockington via the service runs approximately
  every 20 minutes from the City bus station at the Tesco store in Bewell Street (next to the
  roundabout junction of Blueschool Street / Victoria Street / Edgar Street).
- The nearest bus stop to Brockington is located in Vineyard Road near to its junction with Old Eign Hill. The return journey can be made from the same bus stop.

#### HEREFORDSHIRE COUNCIL

#### BROCKINGTON, 35 HAFOD ROAD, HEREFORD.

#### FIRE AND EMERGENCY EVACUATION PROCEDURE

In the event of a fire or emergency the alarm bell will ring continuously.

You should vacate the building in an orderly manner through the nearest available fire exit.

You should then proceed to Assembly Point J which is located at the southern entrance to the car park. A check will be undertaken to ensure that those recorded as present have vacated the building following which further instructions will be given.

Please do not allow any items of clothing, etc. to obstruct any of the exits.

Do not delay your vacation of the building by stopping or returning to collect coats or other personal belongings.



Where possible this agenda is printed on paper made from 100% Post-Consumer waste. De-inked without bleaching and free from optical brightening agents (OBA). Awarded the Nordic Swan for low emissions during production and the Blue Angel environmental label



MEETING:	CABINET
DATE:	12 JULY 2010
TITLE OF REPORT:	THE FUTURE OF DILWYN CHURCH OF ENGLAND (C OF E) PRIMARY SCHOOL
PORTFOLIO AREA:	ICT, EDUCATION & ACHIEVEMENT

**CLASSIFICATION: Open** 

#### **Wards Affected**

Golden Cross with Weobley

# **Purpose**

To consider options for the future of Dilwyn Church of England Primary School (Dilwyn School) and the key reasons for the recommendations. These include:

- past, present and future pupil numbers which do not enable valid educational provision as a standalone entity,
- the availability of school places in the area,
- finance, with the total average funding for a pupil at Dilwyn School being £5,849 compared to the average of £3,666 for a Herefordshire primary school,
- the considered view of the Local Authority, Diocese of Hereford, and Archdiocese of Cardiff
  that the proposal of collaboration between St Mary's Roman Catholic High School and Dilwyn
  School does not address their concerns in terms of pupil numbers and sustainability.

These reasons are expanded upon in the main body of the report.

# **Key Decision**

This is not a Key Decision.

# Recommendation(s)

#### **THAT Cabinet:**

- (a) Consider the information presented in this report.
- (b) Agree that the Local Authority will initiate the statutory process concerning the closure of Dilwyn Church of England Primary School with effect from 31 August 2011.

Further information on the subject of this report is available from David Sanders, Director of Children's Services 01432 260039

# **Key Points Summary**

- Dilwyn School has 31 pupils on roll (January 2010 Census) and has been the subject of a review led by the Local Authority and the Hereford Diocese Director of Education, with the involvement of school governors, under Herefordshire's Small Schools Policy. The findings of the review raised significant concerns over the viability of the school as a standalone entity, including the impact of continued small numbers of pupils at the school and the resulting resources (including staffing), experience and quality of learning, and safeguarding arrangements. Officers recommended that a consultation be initiated to consider the future of the school involving a wider group of stakeholders.
- Between 1<sup>st</sup> February and 30<sup>th</sup> April, the Local Authority consulted on four options for the future of the school: to remain as a standalone school; federation with another school(s); amalgamation; closure of the school. The consultation showed strong community and school support to retain a primary school in Dilwyn. Most responses favoured the retention of the school as a standalone entity, but a significant number favoured federation with another school. This was also an option acceptable to most of those who would prefer a standalone school, if the alternative was to be closure of the school.
- Although strong community and school support has been demonstrated, with significant emphasis placed on the contribution a school in Dilwyn would make to maintaining the life and character of the village, the responses have not brought with them sufficiently robust solutions to the issues that the school faces. The Local Authority, the Diocese of Hereford and the Archdiocese of Cardiff have welcomed a considered proposal from St Mary's Roman Catholic (RC) High School to work in close partnership with Dilwyn School, leading to a hard federation. Significant work has been undertaken between the two schools to develop this proposal. However, after careful analysis of the proposal by the Local Authority, the Diocese of Hereford, and the Archdiocese of Cardiff, it is the view of all three organisations that the proposal does not adequately address their concerns on pupil numbers, finance and sustainability of improvement in teaching and learning, assessment and safeguarding arrangements. It does however provide a strong basis for future development of an ecumenical approach in Herefordshire.
- The future of Dilwyn School has to be considered within the requirements of legislation. Teaching and learning opportunities, community impact, transport considerations and rurality are all key requirements to be considered. These are set alongside the effective use of public money and the wider context of school places in the area. There are sufficient surplus places in the surrounding schools to provide appropriate places for the pupils at Dilwyn now, and in the future, as well as offering Church of England places for those whose parents would prefer them.
- In the absence of sufficiently robust and sustainable solutions coming forward to address the issues raised in the consultation, either as a standalone school, or as part of a hard federation, and with a lack of support for amalgamation with another school, closure of Dilwyn School from 31<sup>st</sup> August 2011 is the recommended option.

# **Alternative Options**

1 The following alternative options have been considered and rejected for the reasons given:

That Dilwyn School continues as a standalone entity. Although there has been much support for this option from the Dilwyn community, no new evidence was forthcoming from the

consultation to alter the view of the Local Authority and Hereford Diocese Director of Education that the school is not sustainable as a standalone entity, for the reasons described later in this report.

**That Dilwyn School should amalgamate with another school**. Neither the Local Authority, nor the Hereford Diocese Director of Education believe there to be advantages to amalgamation over closure. There was very little support for this option during the consultation.

That Dilwyn School should federate with another school, or schools. During the consultation process, the Local Authority received a proposal for federation from St Mary's RC High School, Lugwardine. For reasons described later in this report, the Local Authority, the Diocese of Hereford, and the Archdiocese of Cardiff have not been convinced that the proposed federation between St Mary's RC High School and Dilwyn School addresses adequately the educational and financial concerns highlighted through the review of Dilwyn School.

#### **Reasons for Recommendations**

The recommendation to pursue the statutory process for the closure of Dilwyn School is made in the educational interests of the pupils of Dilwyn and for the effective use of public funds.

# **Introduction and Background**

- Dilwyn School currently has 31 pupils on roll (January 2010 census), against a total pupil capacity of 56, and has had fewer than 36 pupils on roll in all but one of the previous four years.
- When the pattern of pupil numbers at a school falls below 36, Herefordshire Council's Small Schools Policy requires the Council to carry out a review of the school. If the school is a Church of England school, like Dilwyn, the review is carried out in consultation with the Director of the Hereford Diocesan Board of Education. As Dilwyn School's pupil numbers had been in significant decline over a sustained period, falling below 36 in the current year and all but one of the previous four years, a review was carried out. In January 2010 the Cabinet Member for Education, Achievement and ICT took a decision, in the light of the findings of the review group, to enter into a consultation on the future of the school. The consultation was undertaken between 1st February and 30th April 2010 and invited comment on four options for the future of Dilwyn School: to remain as a standalone school; federation with another school(s); amalgamation; closure of the school.

# **Key Considerations**

#### Review of Dilwyn School under the Council's Small Schools Policy

- In line with the existing Herefordshire Small Schools Policy, a review group comprising the Head Teacher, Chair of Governors, Governor Representatives, Director of the Diocesan Board of Education and officers of the council's Children & Young People's Directorate met over several months during 2009. The review group looked at:
  - Quality of teaching and learning
  - Current staffing arrangements (including opportunities for training & development and

- arrangements for safeguarding)
- Effectiveness of safeguarding procedures in place
- Effectiveness of leadership within the school
- Trends in pupil numbers and parental preference locally
- Location of the school and transport issues
- Financial stability of the school and impact of current/projected pupil numbers on that stability
- Exploration of opportunities for federation/amalgamation
- In summary the findings of the review under Herefordshire's Small Schools Policy did not confirm that Dilwyn School would be a sustainable school, given the continued and projected low numbers of pupils, the resulting pressures on finances, teaching and learning including opportunities for pupils, and pressures on staff, resources, and safeguarding arrangements.

#### Teaching and learning - small school challenges in the context of Dilwyn School

- The primary concern of the Local Authority is to ensure high quality and sustainable teaching and learning for pupils now and in the future. Dilwyn School faces a number of challenges due to the small numbers at the school, now and projected into the future. There are also some areas of strength as a small school and these are considered as well in coming to the recommendation. The National College for Leadership of Schools and Children's services (2009) states "as organisations, small schools have a high degree of complexity, stemming from the small numbers of staff they employ and the intricate remit they fulfil. In particular, headteachers have fewer opportunities to delegate their work and as a result are more likely to have to engage directly with diverse groups of stakeholders. Dealing with initiatives such as extended services, for instance, is therefore markedly more challenging within a small school context."
- In the case of Dilwyn School, the Review Group found clear evidence that the headteacher's workload is exacerbated by the limited staffing available and that for an individual undertaking this role it is not sustainable
- The National College research also concluded that rural small schools face different demands to many larger schools because of the more central role they play in their local community. In such contexts, the school is more embedded and significant to community life than larger schools, which adds to its complexity. Furthermore, most small school headteachers teach. This places considerable additional demands on their time, and can act as an obstacle for accessing professional development.
- The demands that new initiatives and policies place on schools are often more keenly felt in small schools than their larger counterparts. Perhaps unsurprisingly, increasing management and leadership tasks are the greatest preoccupation of small school headteachers. Often the time for detailed and systematic strategic leadership tasks, such as rigorous self evaluation, is limited.
- Mutual support networks are potentially more important for small schools but ironically the research found them to be more difficult to establish and sustain. However, networking for mutual benefit potentially provides a useful basis which could be built upon further through formal collaboration and federation. In Herefordshire this has been developed through cluster working, and the proposal between Dilwyn School and St Mary's RC High School suggests some ways of supporting the small school.
- 12 Research into leadership in small schools in 2009 found that some small school head

teachers reported difficulty in offering posts to newly qualified teachers as work demands limited their ability to provide a regular monitoring role.

- In 2000 Ofsted reported on the comparative performance of small schools, defined as those with fewer than 100 pupils. It found that whilst small primary schools achieved markedly better test results, after adjusting for socio-economic factors, those differences were marginal.
- They also stated "the quality of teaching in small schools is generally better than in larger schools". This often links to the involvement of the Headteacher in taking on a significant teaching load and research states that this can be potentially helpful in raising standards in those instances where the Headteacher is a particularly good teacher. It can also lead to marked variation in some small schools where the quality of teaching and learning is significantly different within a small pool of teachers and where in some cases a child remains with a weaker teacher for a disproportionately longer period of time and in some cases for up to four years.
- Many of the above issues and small school challenges were reflected by Ofsted in their inspection of Dilwyn School, in January 2010.
- The school's overall effectiveness and its capacity for sustained improvement were found to be satisfactory. There were many good features in the school and pupil attendance was judged outstanding. The quality of teaching was satisfactory at the time of the inspection but not good as it was uneven in its quality and impact. The provision in the school was also satisfactory and not good because the contribution the curriculum was making to the outcomes of pupils were uneven and the quality of teaching was inconsistent, particularly in the use of assessment. The school received support from the Local Authority and Diocese, including external moderation support to achieve these standards.
- During the consultation period, the Local Authority and Hereford Diocese Director of Education received a submission from St Mary's RC High School with a proposal to work in close partnership with Dilwyn School, possibly leading to a formal federation (Appendix 1). The proposal acknowledges a lack of primary experience which will be tested by the introduction of the new primary curriculum based on cross curricular links. It is not possible to comment on the capacity for, and quality of, support that could be offered by the proposal. St Mary's has entered into an arrangement with St Joseph's RC Primary School and the head has mentioned that there would be potential to share expertise across the schools.

#### **Pupil numbers**

- Dilwyn School's pupil numbers have been declining over a sustained period, falling below 36 in the current year and all but one of the previous four years. There are currently 31 pupils on roll (January Census 2010) of whom 12 come from outside the catchment area. There are 53 primary-aged pupils (January Census 2010) who reside in the catchment area of which only 19 attend Dilwyn School. There are currently 21 unfilled places. Dilwyn School therefore does not provide education for the majority of its local children.
- There has been a significant decline in pupil numbers in Herefordshire over recent years and the numbers are not expected to rise substantially at Dilwyn School or its surrounding schools, with the probable exception of Credenhill St Mary's C of E Primary School where additional local demand is being experienced. There are currently 146 surplus school places in and neighbouring the Weobley School's Cluster (Appendix 2). Appendix 3 sets out the projected numbers of pupils on roll at schools in and near the Weobley Schools Cluster. These are not projected to increase significantly to make a difference to the recommendation. Appendix 4

indicates the schools attended by children living in the Dilwyn catchment area and the school catchment areas that Dilwyn School draws children from. Fundamentally there are sufficient places available for pupils to be educated in the local area now and into the future, were Dilwyn School to close.

- There is a suggestion in many responses to the consultation, including in a proposal submitted by St Mary's RC High School, that children in the Dilwyn catchment area will be attracted to attend Dilwyn School if it is seen to have a secure future. This assumption is not supported by the responses to the consultation where those parents responding to the consultation and who have chosen other schools for their children provided a number of reasons for positively choosing alternative schools. No parents responded that they had chosen an alternative school because they felt uncertain about the future of Dilwyn School.
- It is unlikely that those who choose to go to private school would change their choice and similarly there is no evidence to suggest that those who choose to attend non church schools would be any more attracted by the setting up of a joint Roman Catholic/Church of England school. Those who have already chosen alternative schools are unlikely to change schools and it is most probable that siblings are likely to attend the same school as their older brothers or sisters. The Local Authority, Diocese of Hereford, and the Archdiocese of Cardiff do not consider that there is sufficient evidence to believe that pupil numbers at Dilwyn School will increase sufficiently to influence the viability of the school.
- 22 The proposal also suggests that establishing a unique 'church school' partnership would attract other pupils particularly perhaps those from families of the Catholic faith. This is an attractive idea which would be likely to commend itself to both the Church of England and to the Catholic Church. The detailed proposal provides a strong basis on which to explore future ecumenical approaches in the right circumstances, something the Local Authority will take forward in partnership with the Diocese of Hereford and the Archdiocese of Cardiff. However, information about potential numbers of Catholic children, based on baptism records for the parishes of Weobley/Kington and Leominster suggest that there has been only a small number of children recorded as being baptised between 2005 and 2009. For the Weobley/Kington area these amount to 13 and for Leominster area 10 across 5 year groups. These very small numbers average fewer than 5 a year across a large area of north Herefordshire, where some will inevitably choose nearer schools to home. Such numbers would not secure a significant increase in pupil numbers on roll at Dilwyn School. While such a unique 'church school' may also be an attractive option to non Catholic families, the Local Authority, Diocese of Hereford, and the Archdiocese of Cardiff are collectively mindful of the fact that within the Weobley schools' cluster and neighbouring schools, there are significant number of surplus school places.

#### **Finance**

- The average cost of educating a child in a Herefordshire primary school is £3,151 (without additional grant income). The actual cost for Dilwyn School is £4,718, which is greater than the £3,830 per pupil funding that the Council receives from the Government. The allocation of additional grant income means that, in total, Dilwyn School receives £5,849 per pupil compared to the average of £3,666 for a Herefordshire primary school.
- Falling pupil numbers across Herefordshire means less money is received from central government in total and this has to be shared among all primary and secondary schools.
- The proposal submitted by St Mary's RC High School to work in close partnership with Dilwyn School, possibly leading to a formal federation, is a serious and constructive attempt to show

a funding model which would sustain Dilwyn School so that it is not a drain on the financial resources of St Mary's RC High School.

- However, the proposal does not address the following fundamental issues:
  - There is no management charge identified from Dilwyn School to St Mary's RC High School to pay for the executive head's time
  - St Mary's RC High School recognises that administration savings will be minimal Dilwyn School's spend being £1,955. It is difficult to envisage how St Mary's RC High School could spend any less.
  - Dilwyn School's budget appears understated. Expenditure in 2009/10 was £210,067 against an income of £192,732. A brought forward balance from 2008/09 of £16,840 was used to reduce the budget deficit to £495. The Governors' budget plan is for £200k in 2010/11 dropping to £194k in 2011/12. It has been difficult to see where savings would be made to keep within their budget.
  - The budget settlement for future years will be tight and will expect 0.9% efficiency savings from all schools including Dilwyn School.
  - Potentially replacing the headteacher with a teacher in charge in Sept 2011 as suggested is likely to save £10,000 at most and this could be offset by any management charge to St Mary's RC High School.
  - Dilwyn School is on the Minimum Funding Guarantee (MFG) in 2010/11. Adding three extra children, as quoted in the proposal, would add £11,000 to the school's budget, £5,000 of which comes from the MFG. This is an additional cost paid for from the Herefordshire Schools Budget and therefore by other schools. It is likely to increase further the unit cost of Dilwyn School. Adding ten extra pupils, as also suggested by the proposal, increases the MFG cost to £14,000. In other words, there is an extra cost to other schools of Dilwyn School attracting new pupils. This of course is exacerbated if the pupils transfer from other schools where their unit cost is lower and they do not currently attract the MFG.
  - Dilwyn School carried forward £51,464 Devolved Formula Capital into 2010/11. The 2010/11 allocation is £20,310, giving a total Devolved Formula Capital budget of £71,774.
- Consultation responses have noted that Herefordshire should expect small schools to cost proportionally more than large schools, and that this is equitable for the pupils attending small schools and also necessary to keep Herefordshire's character. However, the Small Schools Policy is designed to assess the future of schools when they reach a point over time that calls into question their long term viability.
- Overall, the proposal is based around some cost savings on teaching which may not be achievable and increasing pupil numbers based on the perceived attractiveness of a close working relationship with St Mary's RC High School. Whilst there is reference to 'significant inward funding from the community' which may help to address funding issues this is not explicit. The extra pupils can only come from other schools thereby weakening those schools. Extra pupils at Dilwyn School will increase the cost of the MFG taking further funding from all schools.

#### **Transport**

- A number of pupils walk to Dilwyn School and some others travel short distances by car. The local authority, Diocesan Board of Education and schools do promote sustainable travel, and where possible walking to school. However, this factor needs to be considered within the context of the sustainability of the school and quality of teaching and learning for the pupils now and in the future. If Dilwyn School should close, the Local Authority's policy on assisting pupils with home to school transport would apply. In addition to the Council's normal home to school transport policy, the Council would also provide transport to any pupil on roll at, and living in the catchment area of, Dilwyn School when it closes, where the journey to the next nearest primary school, or next nearest Church of England primary school, is greater than their journey would have been to Dilwyn School. The cost to the Local Authority of providing transport in such circumstances has been calculated at £22,000 per year. Car travel may be increased if parents choose to enrol children at anywhere other than a Local Authority designated alternative school. However, this may be off-set where parents who are currently transporting children to alternative schools could become entitled to school transport.
- The proposal received from St Mary's RC High School raises the issue of distance between the two schools. This is a fundamental issue in terms of how often and for what purposes children from Dilwyn School might travel to St Mary's RC High School; the cost of this travel and likewise for St Mary's RC High School pupils travelling to Dilwyn School, if this is envisaged. It is unclear from the proposal what the pattern might be and how this cost will be met as it would not be picked up by the Local Authority.

#### Safeguarding.

- There have been concerns regarding safeguarding arrangements. Dilwyn School governors have worked with the Diocesan Board of Education and the Local Authority to put in place revised arrangements which satisfy basic requirements. However, the arrangements also rely heavily upon the availability of instant staff cover to be provided by another school. The Local Authority and Diocesan Board of Education remain concerned about the robustness of these safeguarding arrangements.
- The proposal received from St Mary's RC High School acknowledges the challenges for safeguarding, posed by a small staff base. Given the minimal staffing levels at Dilwyn School, the school currently has an arrangement with Weobley High School to provide staff cover when required. The Local Authority, Diocese of Hereford and Archdiocese of Cardiff have reservations about the effectiveness of this arrangement in an emergency, where instant support is needed, given that the schools are 3 miles apart. The distance to St Mary's RC High School is 15 miles. The proposal refers to the fact that a number of St Mary's RC High School staff live in the Dilwyn area. This does not provide a robust and sustainable solution. Reliance upon another school for safeguarding support has already been tested and found not to have been successful during the inclement weather last winter where Dilwyn School had to close after it had become aware that Weobley High School had taken the decision to close.

#### **Buildings**

Dilwyn School has a Planned Admission Number of 8 and capacity of 56. The main school building was built in 1845 and has benefited from a number of alterations and minor extensions over time. The school is well maintained, although the value of the maintenance backlog is currently £36,421. At 1<sup>st</sup> April 2010, the school held a total of £71,774 in Devolved Formula Capital. In terms of suitability, the school does not meet Government guidelines in relation to classroom and ancillary space, with many spaces having a dual use. For example, the library doubles as the school hall and is only accessible via the classrooms. There are two

classrooms. One is considered small as there is no separate practical area for the children to use (51.32 sq m compared with an expected 63.00 sq m). The playing field is leased. While such suitability issues are not uncommon in schools of this era, it is recognised that significant capital investment would be needed to address the issues in the long term. The Local Authority should consider whether such investment in the current premises would be an efficient use of public funds, given the surplus capacity and suitable accommodation at nearby schools.

#### Analysis of responses to the statutory consultation on the future of Dilwyn School

- Nearly 180 responses were received. These include a submission from the Governing Body of Dilwyn School expressing the view that the school is satisfactory and that the Local Authority is considering closure as an option for the school because of what might happen in the future, not what is occurring now. The Dilwyn community also submitted a response strongly supporting the retention of a primary school in the village. Reference has already been made earlier in this report to a proposal from St Mary's RC High School to work closely with Dilwyn School, possibly towards a hard federation. The full proposal is contained in Appendix 1.
- A response to the St Mary's RC High School proposal expressing concerns has been received by the Local Authority from the Chairs of Governors of the other schools in the Weobley Schools' Cluster. The Local Authority, Diocese of Hereford and Archdiocese of Cardiff recognise the autonomy of school governing bodies to explore and develop collaborative working and hard federation arrangements. Indeed, both organisations actively support this approach where they believe it to be in the best interests not only of the pupils of those schools, but also to all the children of the locality. The concerns of the cluster are shared by the Local Authority and the Diocese of Hereford. Specifically, these are:
  - There is a significant level of surplus capacity within the cluster and neighbouring schools, equating to 146 places (15%). Federation between Dilwyn School and St Mary's RC High School, particularly if attendance at Dilwyn School is given a level of priority for admission to St Mary's RC High School, could have a significant and detrimental affect on other cluster and neighbouring schools. The Chairs of Governors quote the effect of Wigmore High School's change of admissions criteria, to give a higher priority for admittance to those attending Wigmore Primary School, with parents apparently choosing to transfer their children to Wigmore Primary School prior to the secondary transfer process in order to secure a place at Wigmore High School.
  - The Weobley Schools' Cluster operates a soft federation model where collaboration is valued to support, as far as possible, sustainability of schools within the cluster. Collaboration is well developed with joint lesson planning, shared training, wrap around care provided for the cluster at Weobley Primary School and safeguarding and financial/administrative support provided to Dilwyn School by Weobley High School. It is felt that federation outside the cluster would challenge the principles and ethos underpinning collaboration resulting in cluster working being ineffective.
- In terms of individual responses and responses from other community establishments and organisations, including St Mary's Church Dilwyn and the Dilwyn Cedar Club, the school is clearly valued by the people of Dilwyn. 23 parents of the school, including 5 with pre-school age children, and 3 prospective parents responded in support of the school, as did 8 staff and governors, separate to the composite submission from Dilwyn School. 121 local residents responded, including 8 Dilwyn Parish Councillors. Support for the school was also expressed by 6 people who had attended, or whose children had attended Dilwyn School in the past, but

who no longer live in the Dilwyn community.

- There were 6 responses from headteachers, staff and governors of other schools.
- The Local Authority consulted the current pupils of Dilwyn School, who wish the school to remain. Parents of children at the school particularly value the school being part of the community and its friendly, caring ethos where their children are treated with esteem, feel happy and safe and receive individual attention. Almost all said they are happy with the standard of education with some referring to the good grounding for success of former pupils at high school. The consultation undertaken with the pupils of Dilwyn School reflected these views.
- Given the relatively high proportion of children in the catchment area who do not attend Dilwyn School, the consultation invited parents to say why they have not opted to send their child to Dilwyn School. Some had previously attended Dilwyn School, but felt that other schools were better able to meet their child's needs. Some had chosen independent education while, for some, travel to alternative state schools is more convenient. Some parents chose alternative schools that provide before and after school care. No parents who responded indicated that they had chosen another school because they were concerned for the future of Dilwyn School.
- Nearly two thirds of the responses came from local residents who, although having no direct link with school in terms of children currently attending, feel that the school contributes to the community through its involvement with the local church, village show and other village activities. Many of the local residents support the school by attending events at the school, in particular school plays and social and fund raising events.
- In terms of responses to the specific options put forward in the consultation document, 51 were in favour of the school federating with another school, with a further 20 supporting this option if Dilwyn School could not operate as a standalone school. 73 responses favour Dilwyn School continuing as a standalone school, 4 were in favour of amalgamation with another school and 5 felt that the school should close.
- Of those who support Dilwyn School continuing as a standalone school, or for it to federate with another school, the majority express a belief that the village community will be the poorer for not having a school. There is much support for the past and current achievement of the school, in terms of ethos, standards and contribution to community events. There is also a belief that a secure future will encourage a significant number of families to send their children to Dilwyn School. The potential educational and financial benefits of federating with another school were also highlighted as important factors, along with retaining the autonomy of the school within a federation. Those who felt the school should close and pupils transfer to other schools believed this would be the right option in terms of educational provision and opportunities for children and it would be a better option in terms of public spending.

#### **Recent National Developments**

The new Government is introducing proposals for interested groups to establish Free Schools. The Secretary of State will make an initial judgement on the potential of a group to establish a Free School based on criteria relating to educational aims and objectives, evidence of demand, potential premises and the suitability of the provider. If the proposal satisfies the Secretary of State in these areas, a full business case and plan must then be submitted. A crucial element of the business case appears to be the requirement of comprehensive evidence that there is demand for the school and that it will be financially viable over a minimum five-year period. One of the Local Authority's key concerns for Dilwyn School is the

low number of pupils on roll currently and the lack of evidence that pupil numbers will increase, leading to the school becoming financially unsustainable. A Free School would be subject to the same challenges.

# **Community Impact**

- Many of the community responses refer to the fact that the village of Dilwyn has lost its post office and shop in recent years. The Education and Inspections Act 2006 requires that a Local Authority that is considering proposing the closure of a rural primary school must consider the following matters, when formulating their proposals:-
  - the likely effect of the discontinuance of the school on the local community;
  - the availability, and likely cost to the Local Authority of transport to other schools;
  - any increase in the use of motor vehicles which is likely to result from the closure of the school, and the likely effects of any such increase; and
  - any alternatives to the closure of the school.
- The community spirit of Dilwyn has been demonstrated clearly through the consultation. This spirit exists despite the loss of services such as the village post office and the village shop. Responses to the consultation show that the Dilwyn community is passionate about its wish to see primary education continue at Dilwyn School. However, the parents of only 19 of the 53 children in the school's catchment area choose to send their children to the school. The parents of 12 pupils who live outside the catchment area choose to send their children to the school. A common suggestion from the community has been that the school has not attracted pupils in recent years because parents fear it will be closed. The suggestion is that if this perceived fear of closure was to be removed, parents would seek to send their children to the school. The responses to the consultation from parents who have chosen not to send their children to Dilwyn School do not mention fear of closure as a reason.
- If Dilwyn School was to close, concern has been expressed for the future of the pre-school group which operates from the Dilwyn Cedar Hall, adjacent to Dilwyn School, and which has forged strong links with the school. If Dilwyn School was to close, the Local Authority has a duty to ensure that there is sufficient pre-school provision available in the area. A parallel concern is that the Dilwyn Cedar Hall is reliant upon income from the school and the pre-school group. If the viability of the Dilwyn Cedar Hall was called into question by the loss of these sources of income, Local Authority would be able to consider support through its community buildings grant scheme.

# **Financial Implications**

- The closure of Dilwyn School would have the following financial implications:
  - a) There would be no savings made to the Local Authority in terms of the school's delegated budget. The 'per pupil' funding element would follow each pupil to the school to which they transfer. The other elements of the budget such as the management and premises base allocations and small schools' protection funding, around £60,000, would be distributed between all schools through the Herefordshire schools funding formula.
  - b) The Dilwyn School budget would therefore be reinvested, partly in the schools to which Dilwyn

School pupils transfer and, in part, across all Herefordshire schools. Although there is no financial saving to the Local Authority, distribution of the budget across other schools, and in particular the 'per pupil' element brings financial benefit to the new host school or schools in terms of their spending power. As pupils join classes already established with teachers and teaching assistants a higher proportion of the extra pupil funding can be spent of additional classroom support and curriculum resources.

c) There would be a cost to the Local Authority in terms of transport provision to an alternative school or schools. This has been calculated at £22,000 per year. The rural nature of Herefordshire requires the Local Authority to spend around £5 million a year on home to school transport. There would also be a potential one-off maximum staff redundancy cost of £71,880, though the Local Authority would work with the school, using the Council's policies, to minimise the effects on staff wherever possible.

# **Legal Implications**

- The legal context for the process of considering the future of a school and possible closure of a school is provided by the Education and Inspections Act 2006 (EIA 2006) and The School Organisation (Establishment and Discontinuance of Schools) (England) Regulations 2007 (as amended by The School Organisation and Governance (Amendments) (England) Regulations.
- If Cabinet decides to pursue the closure of Dilwyn School, the Local Authority is required to publish a proposal to close the school. From the date of publication of the proposal there will then be a six weeks representation period to allow anyone to object to, or make comment upon, the proposal. The published proposal must contain the information specified in The School Organisation (Establishment and Discontinuance of Maintained Schools) (England) Regulations 2007 (SI 2007 No. 1288) (as amended). The Local Authority is obliged to send a copy of the full proposal to the Hereford Diocesan Board of Education, the Bishop of the Roman Catholic Archdiocese of Cardiff, the trustees of Dilwyn School, the Secretary of State and to any person who requests a copy.
- A summary of the proposal will also need to be published in a local newspaper and be displayed at Dilwyn School and at another prominent place in Dilwyn.
- If there are no objections to the published proposal within the representation period, the proposal must be determined by the Local Authority within 2 months of the end of the representation period (and if not, the proposals must be referred to the schools adjudicator) There is no right of appeal against the Local Authority's decision.
- If there are objections to the proposal, the proposal must be decided by the Local Authority. If the Local Authority fails to decide proposals within 2 months from the end of the representation period they must forward the proposals and any representations to the schools adjudicator for decision. This must be done within one week from the end of the 2 month period. Where there have been objections to the proposal the following bodies may appeal against the Local Authority decision the local Church of England diocese; the Bishop of the local Roman Catholic diocese; and in the case of foundation or a voluntary school, such as Dilwyn School, the governing body or trustees of the school that is proposed for closure.
- Appeals must be submitted to the Local Authority within four weeks of the notification of the Local Authority's decision. On receipt of an appeal the Local Authority must then send the proposals, and the comments and objections received, to the schools adjudicator within one week of the receipt of the appeal. The Local Authority should also send to the schools

adjudicator a copy of the minutes of the Local Authority's meeting or other record of the decision and any relevant papers.

# **Risk Management**

- A decision to close Dilwyn School on 31 August 2011 would require the redeployment or redundancy of the school staff. The Local Authority would support staff through this process and implement the Council's alternative work policy and procedures.
- A decision to keep Dilwyn School open would mean that, given the low pupil numbers the school cannot be considered to be independently educationally and financially sustainable in the near future so there is a risk to pupils' education. The Local Authority would be required to provide additional support to the school to attempt to ensure appropriate pupil education and progression. The school would work with other schools to enhance pupil experience and where possible share and maximise resources.
- If there were to be an appeal to the School Adjudicator through the closure process the School Adjudicator could chose to direct that the school remain open. However, the common view of the Local Authority, the Diocese of Hereford and the Archdiocese of Cardiff indicates that there are strong reasons why the recommendation to close should be pursued.

#### Consultees

- A copy of the consultation document was distributed to the following consultees:
  - The Governing Body of Dilwyn School
  - Families of pupils at the school
  - Teaching and other staff at the school
  - Trade Unions
  - Pupils at the school
  - The Governing Bodies of all other Herefordshire maintained schools
  - Dilwyn Parish Council
  - The Hereford Diocese
  - The Archdiocese of Cardiff
  - The Member of Parliament for the Leominster Constituency

The Local Authority and Hereford Diocese Director of Education were also grateful to Dilwyn Parish Council for publishing the consultation on the web at Dilwyn.com.

In addition, the following consultation events were held at Dilwyn Cedar Hall:

## 11<sup>th</sup> February 2010

- Meeting for Dilwyn School governors 3.00 pm 4.00 pm
- Meeting for Dilwyn School staff
   4.15 pm 5.15 pm
- Meeting for parents of children currently attending, or planning to attend, Dilwyn School
   5.30 pm – 6.30 pm

#### 31<sup>st</sup> March 2010

Dilwyn community meeting, facilitated by Dilwyn
 Parish Council
 7.00 pm – 9.00 pm

The views of the pupils of Dilwyn School were also sought. The process and style of the consultation were agreed with the Chair of Governors and headteacher of Dilwyn School to ensure that appropriate means of communication were used for the full age range of pupils.

#### **Consultation Responses**

Nearly 180 responses were made to the consultation in addition to the views expressed at the above consultation events. An analysis of the consultation responses is contained within the body of the report.

# **Appendices**

**Appendix 1** Proposal from St Mary's RC High School

**Appendix 2** Weobley Schools' Cluster – Numbers of Pupils on roll, January 2010

Appendix 3 Weobley Schools' cluster – Projected Numbers of Pupils on Roll to 2014

**Appendix 4** Schools attended by children in the Dilwyn catchment area and Home school catchment areas of pupils attending Dilwyn School

# **Background Papers**

Consultation Document "Consultation on the future of Dilwyn Church of England Primary School: 1 February – 30 April 2010.

# Appendix 1



St. Mary's RC High

Specialist Science and Applied Learning College





# Proposal for working together within a hard federation

Author Clive Lambert, Head teacher, St Marys RC High

Version No 4

Date: 29<sup>th</sup> April 2010

# **Background**

 Dilwyn School began the process of seeking a federation partner in December 2008. This was stopped at the request of CYPD in February 2009 and resumed in July 2009.

- St Marys RC High School expressed interest in such a relationship during the autumn of 2009 but were unable to pursue this as a result of personal circumstances.
- The parties met in February 2010 and both governing bodies have agreed in principle to a hard federation in April 2010.

Whilst some observers may not see this as an obviously attractive relationship to either party, there are clear long term benefits to families and communities in North Herefordshire as well as to both schools and the proposal has the backing of both the Catholic and Anglican churches.

# **Strengths**

- The ethos of both schools have much in common there is a clear spiritual and values based approach to education that Dilwyn School has sought as a clear prerequisite in any partnership arrangement (see Appendix 1)
- St Mary's is rated an outstanding school and has an established outreach programme to primary schools
- Dilwyn has very strong relationships within the school and much good practice. The recent SIAS report underlined the strong values and care based provision within the school.
- St Mary's has a strong desire to work with new partners and to extend a Christian based educational offering into North Herefordshire.
- Key members of St Mary's staff live near Dilwyn, which negates some of the assumed distance related drawbacks.
- Initial enthusiasm of both church authorities to investigate potential relationship
- Support for Dilwyn School and for this proposal from the local community underpins the probability of long term success.

## Weaknesses

• Distance between the two schools raises issues which will have to be addressed during the lead in to the partnership.

- The high unit cost of education at Dilwyn will need to be addressed. Initial work conducted in the Dilwyn community indicates that significant inward funding from the community may assist in the initial 18 months, until pupil numbers rise.
- The difficulty of providing a full and varied curriculum at Dilwyn will be addressed. This is not considered a significant factor.
- Lack of significant primary school experience at St Mary's requires to be addressed anyway and is only expected to be a short term issue.
- Management of certain key matters such as safeguarding' of children at Dilwyn will need to be assured during the lead in period.
- The nervousness of the local community in supporting Dilwyn school because of the threat of closure will remain a short term issue until sufficient publicity is put in place to assure parents. The current Dilwyn governors have this in hand.

# **Opportunities**

- To establish a unique 'church school' partnership which could act as a model of ecumenical co-operation for others to follow.
- To give presence to the Catholic Church in a part of Herefordshire that has no Catholic Church school
- To give access to St Mary's by amending the admissions policy to give some preference for those pupils at Dilwyn
- If above satisfied likely that roll at Dilwyn will increase in order to gain access for a desired high school
- To have a single administrative function to run both schools.
- Rationalise the staff provision particularly at Dilwyn and thereby cut unit cost.
- To ensue that the staff at Dilwyn can concentrate on the primary task of teaching and looking after the children

\_\_\_\_\_

- To provide a richness of experience for Dilwyn students by regular visits to St Mary's and vice versa.
- To provide further development opportunities for staff at both schools

#### **Threats**

- Local authority opposition to federation of Dilwyn with St Mary's needs to be addressed.
- Local authority not agreeing with proposed admission arrangements may weaken some of the early benefits
- Concern of local people about school being 'run' 19 miles away. This is not considered likely but will be fully addressed during the consultation period with parents.
- Dilwyn running costs may be higher than anticipated in 2010/11. This will be mitigated by community investment in the school, for which there is some local favour. This has been explored as part of alternative plans for running the school.

Version 4 Page 4 of 17 29<sup>th</sup> April 2010

# **Strategic Risk Analysis**

This is drawn from the 'Weaknesses' of the 'SWOT' analysis

Risk	Likelihood	Impact	Score
Distance between the schools	9	5	45
High Unit Cost of Dilwyn	9	9	81
Difficulty of providing full and varied curriculum	7	8	56
Lack of significant primary experience at St Mary'	7	5	35
'Safeguarding' management	6	9	54
Nervousness of local community about closure	8	5	40

The above analysis indicates medium risk ratings for all of the categories.

# Risk mitigation

#### Distance between schools poses a risk for both pupils and teachers:

- St Mary's key staff are 'used to' travelling; one feeder primary school is in Ross-on-Wye.
- Integrate the communication systems both email and telephone.
- Key St Mary's staff can be made available in an unforeseen emergency.
- Children transported by minibus for enhanced curricular opportunities.
- Opportunity for children to experience a different environment.

#### **High Unit Cost of Dilwyn:**

- Reduction of staffing costs as experienced higher paid staff retire/leave, starting autumn 2010.
- Admin functions to be brought 'onto' St Mary's with its benefits of finance manager, facilities manager and extended schools co-ordinator etc...
- Economies of scale should lead to lower costs.

#### Difficulty of providing a full and varied curriculum:

- Relationship with St Mary's and its 'Advanced Skills Teachers' will
  provide additional support in Literacy, Science and the
  environment/local history etc.
- Specialism staff can provide support in Maths and Technology
- Identified 'helper' primary school will provide targeted and rigorous analysis of current curricular provision and assessment of pupil progress.

Version 4 Page 5 of 17 29<sup>th</sup> April 2010

This will translate into an action plan, which they will assist in setting up and running.

## Lack of significant primary experience at St Mary's:

- Key identified staff will participate in appropriate training.
- 'Helper' primary school will assist and advise key staff.
- Excellent willingness to learn and enthusiasm for the project of St Mary's staff
- Support from Head of Wigmore federation offered with 'all through' curriculum.

# Management of 'Safeguarding' of children at Dilwyn

- Ensure that all Dilwyn staff are appropriately trained at the correct level.
- Identified person(s) on Dilwyn site at all times.
- St Mary's Child Protection Officer and/or deputy to be available to Dilwyn in event of emergency.
- Work closely with LA to ensure that protocols are sufficiently robust.

# Nervousness of local community about closure:

- Since consultation began no pupils have left school indicating satisfaction.
- Local community immensely supportive of school and its continuance.
- The prospect of a strong relationship, possible federation, with a wellregarded school would be reassuring and indicative of external confidence in its future.

The challenges must not be underestimated but there is a strong desire on both parties to make this work. Both church bodies have expressed full support for the development of a strong relationship between the schools.

At senior church levels there has been thought given to a possible joint Anglican/Roman Catholic school being formed via a trust. This would give the opportunity for Catholic children living in or near the area to have a primary school to attend as well as providing a unique and exciting school the first of its kind Herefordshire.

\_\_\_\_\_

# Issues relating to a 'Hard' Federation

It was not the intention of St Mary's to pursue a hard federation in the first instance. We are looking to support a Christian school that has strong local support and would enable us to have a Catholic presence in an area of Hereford from where we receive few pupils. There is a small Catholic Church in Weobley (3 miles).

In response to the 'federation matrix', I will comment on the headline categories as appropriate if not previously mentioned in this document.

# Vision and Benefit to Pupils and future Pupils in the Area

We believe that if the future of the school was secure, following its relationship with St Mary's, then the local community would support the school and its numbers would grow. There is potential in the village and the possibility of a 'route' into St Mary's as an established partner may well be an attractive possibility for prospective parents.

If the schools entered into a close working relationship then the resources from the high school, with its network of Advanced Skills teachers, specialist staff, close colleagues from primary schools (a further primary school has indicated a willingness to support the curricular provision) and the desire to do what is necessary makes it possible to cover ECM outcomes, ensure robust Safeguarding and give the pupils a much wider educational experience than is currently possible.

Community is a strength of both schools and this opportunity is unique. The different age ranges only serve to enrich the experience of all pupils.

# Benefits in meeting the challenge of falling pupil numbers

We realise that this will not be an easy challenge. However it is hoped that the 'guaranteed' future of the school coupled with its developing relationship with another established faith based school would be an inducement to the parents of future children.

There are 53 children living in the Dilwyn catchment area of primary school age. The capacity of the school is 56.

Currently28 of these attend either Weobley or Pembridge Primary Schools. Allowing for the proximity of local catchment area boundaries, it is possible in the future, provided that the number of children stays fairly constant (although overall in the county the number is diminishing) because of the desirability of the village as a place to live and bring up children that at least half of these would stay in Dilwyn. A flourishing and vibrant school would at least maintain the numbers attending

Version 4 Page 7 of 17 29<sup>th</sup> April 2010

from outside of the catchment area, particularly if there was a strong Catholic element to the school.

In these circumstances, I would anticipate a steady roll of between 40 and 50. Obviously this might impact on other schools in the area but in reality we are merely trying to ensure that the majority of children living in the Dilwyn area attend that school, with a few others from nearby who may or may not be Catholic, but want a strong Gospel values based education.

Schools attended by childre	<u>en living in l</u>	<u>Dilwyn catchment area</u>
	Number of	
<u>School</u>	<u>children</u>	
Dilwyn C of E Primary	19	
Weobley Primary	14	
Pembridge C of E Primary	14	
Wigmore Primary	2	
lvington C of E Primary	2	
Kingsland C of E Primary	1	
Shobdon Primary	<u>1</u>	
Total	53	
School catchment areas Di	lwyn C of E	Primary draws from
	Number of	
<u>School</u>	<u>children</u>	
Dilwyn C of E Primary	19	
, ,		
· · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · ·	6	
Leominster Infant/Junior Weobley Primary	6	
Leominster Infant/Junior		
Leominster Infant/Junior Weobley Primary	4	

#### **Ethos**

This is perhaps one of the most exciting aspects of the proposal, a first class opportunity to build a closer working relationship between two Faiths that share so

Version 4 Page 8 of 17 29<sup>th</sup> April 2010

\_\_\_\_\_\_

much. Gospel value will be the cornerstone of the foundations of our relationship. We could produce a 'model' for others to follow.

# Benefits in terms of teaching and learning

This is another exciting aspect of the proposed relationship. It is recognised at St Mary's that we do not have sufficient primary experience to make a significant contribution to the quality of teaching and learning on our own. However, as alluded to above, we are in negotiation with a well established and highly successful primary school who have key staff who would be willing to assist us on a consultancy basis. This would help in the delivery of the core curriculum and in the effective assessment of pupils to inform their future learning.

In addition the physical resources of the high school provide an additional space for expanding the learning possibilities for the Dilwyn pupils. The linking of St Mary's students to Dilwyn would not only enrich the experience of St Mary's children but provide increasing insight into the world of the secondary school.

At St Mary's, we have just embarked on a four year plan to change the way in which pupils learn. Drawn from robust research over many years by distinguished scholars, we are implementing strategies to build more resilient and better learners. There are to be three separate areas of focus, the 'Psychology of learning', Self Determination theory applied to curricular reform and 'The Optimistic Child'. We would be intending to use these programmes in the primary phase as that is where their efficacy may be greatest.

I believe that there are some fantastic opportunities here for all.

#### Outline draft plan for development of teaching and learning

Intention	Desired	Date	Resource	Person
	Outcome	completed	Implications	Responsible
Appraisal of	To produce a	31/10/10	5 days and	Clive Lambert
current	report on the		cost of	
provision by St	current		engaging	
Mary's and	provision and		'helper' school	
helper school	action points		£1000	
	for the future		(St Mary's	
			budget)	

Version 4 Page 9 of 17 29<sup>th</sup> April 2010

Work on enhanced curricular plan for KS2	Following report revised KS2 plan and schemes of work produced	31/01/11	Ongoing with key staff. Additional £500 for occasional cover	Head of 'helper school'
Begin link opportunities with St Mary's	Visits in place for KS2 in PE, Science and spiritual development	31/03/11	Transport costs in minibus. Driver already employed	Specialist staff Chris Park Peter Kyles
Assessment overview undertaken	Robust and informative Informal and formal assessment arrangements in place	31/03/11	Would form part of curriculum review.	Head of 'helper' school
Start enhanced curriculum for KS2	Enhanced curriculum at KS2 begins	01/09/11	£1000 new resources	Dilwyn head of teaching and learning
Work on Curricular plan for KS1	Following report revised KS1 plan and schemes of work produced	31/10/11	On going staff and £500 for supply cover as and when needed	Head of 'helper' school
Introduce Mindset and Brainology programme at KS2	Years 5 and 6 complete 'Mindset' sessions and have worked through 'Brainology' programme	31/07/11	Already paid for through 'Well-being' grant	Clive Lambert

 $Version \, 4 \hspace{1.5cm} Page \, 10 \, of \, 17 \hspace{1.5cm} 29^{th} \, April \, 2010$ 

\_\_\_\_\_\_

# **Staffing**

I think that I may have covered this indirectly. For teachers it is the opportunity to work with a wider range of staff in sometimes-different phases of education. Our staff are used to travelling distances to other schools.

Administratively there are obvious advantages in rationalising the 'office functions' and in procurement of resources.

For 'Safeguarding', St Mary's can have a key role in supporting this process and by making key staff available at 'a moments notice' in an emergency.

# Financial Viability

Although St Mary's and the local community recognise that they may have to invest in the short term, the long-term aim is sustainability for Dilwyn. Additional pupils only can secure this. St Mary's cannot and should not 'bail out' Dilwyn. Therefore there will be rigorous scrutiny and realistic budgeting. As indicated elsewhere we believe that it is possible to decrease the unit cost over time of Dilwyn as experienced staff retire. However the long-term solution must be retention and acquisition of pupils. We believe that this is possible for reasons explained above.

The current number on role is 31, we should be aiming for a target figure in excess of 40 consistently year on year for financial viability.

Figures from Dilwyn 3 year budget plan June 2009.

BUDGET HEADING	2008/09 (£) EL01	2009/10 (£) EL01	2010/11 (£) EL01	2011/12 (£) EL01
E01 - Teaching Staff	128,048	127,983	131,183	123,200
E02 - Supply Staff	6,835	6,460	6,622	6,788
E03 - Education Support Staff	16,559	11,438	11,724	12,017
E04 - Premises Staff	9,381	9,510	4,113	4,216
E05 - Admin & Clerical Staff	4,945	7,897	9,068	9,295
E07 - Cost of Other Staff	4,162	4,502	4,615	4,730
I01 - Initial Formula Allocation	147,114	133,690	139,718	146,272

I have selected these elements as these carry the most significant cost @85% of total revenue.

E01- Teaching staff – over a three year period we would look to reduce that figure to the equivalent of 2 full time members and one part time of 0.4 max. We would need one experienced member of staff on the lowest point of the leadership scale or TLR 1, one main scale and a part time min scale.

1.0 f.t.e. Main Scale @£25,000 + 30% oncosts £32,500

0.4 f.t.e. Main Scale @£25,000 + 30% oncosts £13,000

1.0 f.t.e. TLR1 @ £35,00 + 30% oncosts £45,500

Total revised staffing cost £91,000

# I realise that this is an optimistic figure but it is indicative of the savings that could be made.

For the remainder we would hope to reduce the cost of supply staff because of the availability of St Mary's staff to cover when necessary.

E04- The admin function would come into the St Mary's administration and would require only 'occasional' attention. The figure provided in the budget would be easily maintained if not reduced.

IO1- This is a key figure and we would hope that additional pupils would be attending over a this period. Just 3 pupils would add @£10,000 to the income.

The above is unsustainable as a stand-alone budget, but as part of a federation it becomes more realistic. It is likely that in time the school would be become like a 'satellite' and therefore might be a 'cost centre' within the St Mary's overall budget.

It is recognised that initial investment is necessary to bring the school to a sustainable level but it is not intended that St Mary's acts a 'central bank' to Dilwyn.

## Links across the community

I think that this has been covered elsewhere, but I would like to supplement this by highlighting the church community. At St Mary's, approximately 40% of children are non Catholic. This has never been a barrier to full participation of children. We have a lay chaplain so the possibility of joint activities in schools, the local church and St Mary's new chapel are legion.

# Inspection Preparation and Support

Obvious overlaps and benefits from joint activities and a close working relationship. The recognised need to draw on further expertise has been previously mentioned.

# School/Staff and Governance performance management

An obvious advantage of a range of experience available. Relationship of both governing bodies requires exploration.

# Hard Federation: Governance

This has been mentioned elsewhere under 'opportunities'.

It may not be necessary to have a 'hard federation'. We believe much of the above can be achieved without it. However if the consultation with parents and the local community indicates agreement for Dilwyn to change its status in the future, for example as a joint Anglican/RC school or as an associate member of an Archdiocese of Cardiff, Hereford Catholic Education Trust then this would need close examination and may be dependant on the policies of the incoming government.

Opportunities here, but not for the faint hearted!!

The Church of England authorities have already given positive indication regarding the possibility of a joint C of E/RC school and the Catholic Archdiocese of Cardiff have given support to this initiative via the Archbishop and Director of Diocesan Education.

We would consider it prudent to undertake the activities described above as a matter of urgency, but ask the governing bodies of both schools to pursue the concept of a trust to create a joint school.

There is a Catholic benefactor watching our plans with interest.

# One Leadership team

This would be an obvious move, but in view of the distance it would be necessary to have a leadership presence on the site most of the time.

The leadership structure is such to allow for flexibility but the draft proposal is as follows

Executive head teacher Clive Lambert (existing head of St Mary's)

Version 4 Page 13 of 17 29<sup>th</sup> April 2010

\_\_\_\_\_

Deputy Executive head Chris Park (existing Assistant head and Director of Science specialism)

Chief Consultant (head of 'helper' primary school)

Director of Literacy and KS2 curricular development Sean Warde (current A.S.T. English and head of English at St Mary's)

TLR2 Curriculum development Dilwyn C of E Primary School

# Safeguarding

This has been referred to under staffing. However this is a vital aspect of the running of the school and we would wish to work closely with the local authority to ensure that we have in place well understood and robust protocols'.

Teacher in charge of Safeguarding will be Michael Kennedy (Child Protection and Assistant head St Mary's)

Clive Lambert deputises in his absence.

# Geographical Distance

The sites are 15 miles apart, approximately half an hour travelling time. This is not too inconvenient but it is hardly next-door either. Therefore we would be looking to use ICT solutions to overcome this. In addition, we would need to link the telephone systems in order that if a telephone is not answered at Dilwyn it comes to St Mary's and can be set to do so automatically as and when is necessary.

# Proposed outline management plan

# From September 2010:

- St Mary's to take over most of the day to day running of Dilwyn:
- All admin functions transferred to St Mary's
- Appointment of contact administrator for Dilwyn (Rather like triage)
- Current head of Dilwyn to remain as local 'head' responsible for teaching learning and pastoral matters in the first instance.

Version 4 Page 14 of 17 29<sup>th</sup> April 2010

\_\_\_\_\_

- Part time teacher who retires between August and December 2010 to be replaced with a lower cost teacher on reduced hours
- Hours 'lost' from part time to be offset by current head teacher and outreach staff from St Mary's
- Reduced cost of Academic year 2010/11 not likely to be high but during this time further economies to be investigated
- Curriculum and other developments to be promoted from St Mary's and its associated consultants alongside Dilwyn staff
- Discussion between church authorities about possible change of status for Dilwyn school (V.A. or Trust) and change of admissions policy at St Mary's to allow preference to be given to Dilwyn pupils.

# From September 2011

- New full time member of staff in post (following retirement in August 2010)
- Current headteacher to continue or be replaced by a teacher i/c

# Costings

From the 3-year projection expenditure is not predicted to rise. Some of the allocations to premises and admin seem a little thin and therefore it is not reckoned that any real savings be made there.

However the teaching staff presents some opportunity. At best with 1 f.t.e. equivalent, a 0.3 f.t.e. and full time teacher i/c then costs could be reduced from the cuurent @£130,00 to @£110,000.

The school operates 2 classes a KS1 ad KS2. There is capacity each class for the roll to increase. The addition of just 3 children can realise in excess of £10,000.

It is to be hoped that the unit cost per child can be reduced from its present levels to one that is more acceptable to interested parties. This would be achieved by some of the means stated above.

\_\_\_\_\_

# Initial conclusion

This is an exciting challenge for both schools but the workload is not to be underestimated. However, there is a genuine long term advantage to both schools in this partnership and much can be overcome given the commitment of both governing bodies to make this work. Cost savings can be achieved although not significantly. The onus on both schools is to reduce the risks and show Dilwyn as an attractive, secure proposition to parents. There is much to commend it. The environment is beautiful; the intimate feel of the school is to be envied and will be attractive to new parents. Giving the school a more certain future will encourage more parents to send their children as there is capacity for this within the locality. The prospect of committed local Christians being able to send their children to a desired secondary school will be an attractive feature. It will be essential for the church authorities both Anglican and Roman Catholic to strongly support this proposal. For the churches it represent a unique opportunity to promote an exciting ecumenical venture. For the local authority an imaginative potential solution, which would reflect well on them. If they should choose to facilitate and support this arrangement

# **Postscript**

A recent development has been the opening of discussion between the head of St Mary's and the head of the Wigmore federation, Andrew Shaw. He has clearly indicated a willingness to work with us in this process and offer his support. He has been working with schools around the country in different locations helping to set up federations. Andy would be a valuable partner in this process as he brings experience and local knowledge. He feels that this is a venture worth embarking on.

Version 4 Page 16 of 17 29<sup>th</sup> April 2010

\_\_\_\_\_\_

# Appendix 1: Dilwyn: Principles, vision and values

Given the current issues with pupil numbers in Herefordshire, change is inevitable for the school. To manage this change successfully, the school and the wider community will need to be clear about the principles that are central to any negotiation concerning the school, the vision that the community has for the future of the school and the core values that are non negotiable in any proposed change. The following were agreed by the governors in December 2008:

- 1. We are committed to the continuation of state education for 4 to 11 year old children on the Dilwyn site.
- 2. We believe that this is crucial in preserving the nature of the Dilwyn community and the continued attractiveness of the village as a place to live.
- 3. We are committed to the continuation of Christian faith based education and will not support any proposal that endangers or dilutes this. We will actively seek change that strengthens our faith based ties.
- 4. We believe that a small village school with 30 to 50 pupils is both viable and attractive to parents.
- 5. We recognise that such education is expensive compared to urban primary models and will fight to maintain the financial supplements necessary to achieve it.
- 6. We recognise and accept that such a small school may not be able to maintain an appropriate management infrastructure (head teacher, school secretariat, bursar etc) and we will proactively explore any partnership or other options that do not conflict with our principles and values.
- 7. We accept that some of the non core curriculum roles for a school will be difficult for such a small school (extended schools, out of school clubs etc) and we will actively and creatively seek ways of developing such roles using community and other partners.

Dilwyn School Governors

#### Weobley Schools' Cluster - Numbers of Pupils on Roll - Jan 10 Year Groups **Weobley Cluster** Total & Nearest Published Number of Admission Pupils on Total Pupil Ν R **Primary Schools** Capacity 1 4 1 Number Roll Weobley Canon Pyon C of E Credenhill C of E Dilwyn C of E Kingsland C of E Ivington C of E Pembridge C of E Staunton-on-Wye 10 120 125 110 103 121 110 128

# Weobley Schools' Cluster & Nearest Primary Schools- Projected numbers of pupils on roll, based on current year's intakes

	At January each year					
Weobley Cluster & Nearest Primary Schools	2010	2011	2012	2013	2014	Total Pupil Capacity
Weobley	150	133	133	148	145	210
Canon Pyon C of E	77	75	78	72	74	91
Credenhill C of E	179	181	188	193	207	210
Dilwyn C of E	31	31	29	31	26	56
Kingsland C of E	140	135	137	137	140	140
Ivington C of E	84	90	88	93	96	105
Pembridge C of E	96	101	103	93	100	91
Staunton-on-Wye	70	68	63	64	59	70
	827	814	819	831	847	973

# Appendix 4

Schools attended by children living in Dilwyn catchment area				
	Number of			
School	<u>children</u>			
Dilwyn C of E Primary	19			
Weobley Primary	14			
Pembridge C of E Primary	14			
Wigmore Primary	2			
Ivington C of E Primary	2			
Kingsland C of E Primary	1			
Shobdon Primary	<u>1</u>			
Total	53			
School catchment areas Di	lwyn C of E	Primary draws from		
	Number of			
School	children			
Dilwyn C of E Primary	 19			
Leominster Infant/Junior	6			
Weobley Primary	4			
Ivington C of E Primary	1			
Kington Primary	1			
Total	31			